UNITED
NATIONS

A

General Assembly

Distr.
GENERAL

A/51/301
20 August 1996
ENGLISH
ORIGINAL: FRENCH

Fifty-first session
Item 110 of the provisional agenda*

ELIMINATION OF RACISM AND RACIAL DISCRIMINATION

Measures to combat contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance

Note by the Secretary-General

The Secretary-General has the honour to transmit to the General Assembly the report on contemporary forms of racism and racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance prepared by Mr. Maurice Glèlè-Ahanhanzo, Special Rapporteur of the Commission on Human Rights, in accordance with General Assembly resolution 50/135.

* A/51/150.

96-21311 (E) 151096 181096

ANNEX

Report of Mr. Maurice Glèlè-Ahanhanzo, Special Rapporteur of the Commission on Human Rights on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance

CONTENTS

		Paragraphs	Page
I.	INTRODUCTION	1 - 5	3
II.	STATUS REPORT ON THE EXECUTION OF THE MANDATE	6 - 17	3
	A. Observations of the German Government on matters relating to Germany discussed in the report submitted by the Special Rapporteur in 1994 (A/49/677)		4
	B. Observations by the Italian Government on the report submitted by the Special Rapporteur in 1995 (A/50/476)		7
	C. Comments of the Special Rapporteur	7	9
	D. Field missions	8 - 17	9
III.	CONTEMPORARY FORMS AND MANIFESTATIONS OF RACISM, RACIAL DISCRIMINATION AND XENOPHOBIA	18 - 46	11
	A. The worldwide immigration crisis	19 - 37	12
	B. Racist horror and terror become commonplace	38 - 44	18
	C. Incitement to racial hatred through electronic and computer networks	45 - 46	19
IV.	MEASURES TAKEN BY GOVERNMENTS AND JUDICIAL BODIES	47 - 51	20
	A. Implementation of the recommendations formulated by the Special Rapporteur	47 - 48	20
	B. Judicial measures	49 - 51	21
V.	INITIATIVES BY CIVIL SOCIETY	52 - 54	21
VI.	CONCLUSIONS	55 - 59	22

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The Commission on Human Rights, at its fifty-second session, took note of the reports submitted by the Special Rapporteur 1/ and expressed its full support and appreciation for his work and for its continuation.

2. Accordingly, the Commission decided to extend for a period of three years the mandate of the Special Rapporteur to examine incidents of contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, any form of discrimination, inter alia, against Blacks, Arabs and Muslims, xenophobia, negrophobia, anti-Semitism and related intolerance, as well as governmental measures to overcome them, and to report on these matters on a yearly basis to the Commission, beginning at its fifty-third session.

3. The Commission nevertheless regretted that the Special Rapporteur had again encountered difficulties in his efforts to fulfil his mandate, owing to the lack of necessary resources. It thus requested the Secretary-General to provide, without any further delay, the Special Rapporteur with all the necessary assistance and resources to carry out his mandate and enable him to submit an interim report to the General Assembly at its fifty-first session and a comprehensive report to the Commission at its fifty-third session.

4. This report is submitted in response to the Commission's request. As the Centre for Human Rights of the Secretariat is still understaffed, the notes verbales could not be transmitted on time to Member States in order to gather the necessary information for the preparation of this document. Accordingly, the Special Rapporteur relied mainly on sources from quasi-governmental agencies (national human rights commissions, commissions to combat racism) and non-governmental organizations. He also consulted reliable articles in the international press.

5. The analysis which follows is divided into four sections followed by conclusions and recommendations. The first section is a status report on the execution of the mandate; the second is on manifestations of racism, racial discrimination and xenophobia. Section III examines measures taken by Governments. Lastly, section IV deals with the initiatives taken by civil society.

II. STATUS REPORT ON THE EXECUTION OF THE MANDATE

6. In this section, the Special Rapporteur presents the observations of Germany on certain paragraphs of the report he submitted to the General Assembly at its forty-ninth session (A/49/677) and those of Italy on portions of his report submitted to the General Assembly at its fiftieth session (A/50/476). He also reviews missions he has taken to various countries, discusses future missions and redefines the orientation of his mandate.

A. Observations of the German Government on matters relating to Germany discussed in the report submitted by the Special Rapporteur in 1994 (A/49/677)

Observations on paragraph 65

"1. The Department of Justice of Saxe-Anhalt has no knowledge of the incident of 9 October 1994 referred to in this paragraph."

Observations on paragraph 67

"2. The Prosecutor's Office of Hamburg is conducting an inquiry into two police officers accused of maltreatment of persons of colour on, inter alia, racist grounds.

"3. On 13 September 1994, 27 police officers were suspended. Since 19 September, the Prosecutor's Office and the police of Hamburg have been conducting an inquiry into accusations by police officers who witnessed the incidents that some of their colleagues committed acts of violence at the central police station and that there were cases of maltreatment in the precinct at police station No. 11 (Kirchenallee) in Hamburg as part of a campaign to control drug use in public. The measures to suspend the police officers in question were revoked on 28 September 1994, after the inquiry failed to yield sufficient evidence to support the accusations. However, the police officers accused of maltreating foreigners at station No. 11 were transferred to other offices as part of a personnel redeployment exercise. Disciplinary measures will be taken after criminal proceedings have been concluded.

"4. As for the bodily harm inflicted on a 44-year-old Senegalese national, at the request of the public prosecutor, the court handed down a sentence against the two police officers responsible. This sentence is final and executory. Following the criminal proceedings, disciplinary proceedings against the two police officers are now under way.

"5. In response to the accusations brought against the police officers, the Department of Justice of Hamburg established a Working Group which conducted inquiries into 118 trials, mainly involving police officers from stations Nos. 11 and 16 and the Mitte Special Assignments Squad (central police station), who had been accused of committing acts of violence and other less serious violations (Vergehen) on xenophobic grounds. In a number of cases, the three-member Working Group, which had received no instructions and whose only mandate was to conduct an inquiry into the above-mentioned cases, criticized either the inquiries conducted by members of the police stations in question or the manner in which the public prosecutor had handled the case.

"6. The report on the inquiry was transmitted to the Prosecutor of Hamburg, who will have to determine those cases in which the inquiry should be reopened on the basis of the criticisms made by the Commission of Inquiry. The public prosecutor of the Regional Court of Hamburg will also

conduct a special re-examination of all criminal cases in the past four years involving police officers accused of inflicting bodily harm on persons, using force or detaining them illegally, in order to decide, on the basis of the same criteria, whether an investigation should be reopened.

"7. The Prosecutor will make his findings known to the Hamburg police authorities, with whom he will attempt to determine how to bring about a radical improvement in the conduct of inquiries in what are commonly known as 'police cases'.

"8. Moreover, the Ministry of the Interior has taken the necessary measures to deal more severely with police officers found guilty of crimes, by reorganizing the competent services and increasing personnel. These services have been instructed to introduce a preventive early warning system which should help to anticipate problems in the police and to take preventive measures.

"9. The training and advanced training of police officers have been considerably intensified in order to respond to the current situation. The professional training programme of the Police Training Institute has been adapted to the changing situation and includes courses on professional ethics and contemporary political problems; moreover, a number of programmes are being implemented with the assistance of outside participants in order to offer advanced training courses to police officers, particularly those stationed in trouble spots. Budget allocations for the advanced training courses were increased by DM 550,000."

Observations on paragraph 68

"(a) The incident in Berlin

"10. Following an altercation with a passenger of Iranian nationality, the driver of a public transport bus called the police. When the police arrived on the scene, they maltreated the Iranian national who filed a complaint.

"11. The fact that the three police officers were sentenced to heavy fines for maltreatment and insults shows that the police and the courts of Berlin follow up all accusations brought against public officials, using the necessary means under the rule of law, that the police and the public prosecutor conduct their inquiries with all necessary diligence, and that such acts of violence have met with the appropriate reaction. Moreover, the convicted police officers must undergo disciplinary proceedings."

"(b) Incidents in Bernau (Brandenburg)

"12. In June 1994, the Prosecutor of Frankfurt an der Oder opened an investigation against Brandenburg police officers accused of maltreating Vietnamese nationals. In February 1995, eight police officers were referred to the Court of Frankfurt an der Oder; in March 1995, two others

were referred to the local court of Brandenburg. Nine police officers were suspended and another has already been dismissed.

"13. The allegation in the report of the Special Rapporteur that a chief of police was guilty of maltreatment is erroneous."

Observations on paragraph 88

"Deaths of Nigerian nationals

"14. On 30 August 1994, a Nigerian national died just as he was about to be sent back to his country. The Prosecutor's Office opened an investigation in order to determine whether the death was caused by the injection of a sedative given to him just before his departure. The investigation is still in progress. The cause-and-effect relationship between the injection of the sedative and the death of the Nigerian national, which the Special Rapporteur presumes in his report, has not yet been established.

"15. A detailed account of the facts is contained in report No. 23 of the Federal Ministry of the Interior. This report rules out the hypothesis contained in the report of the Special Rapporteur that the deaths referred to by the Embassy of Nigeria were the result of maltreatment by the German authorities.

"16. The documents contained in the annex also report the findings of the inquiry conducted by the Federal Ministry of the Interior with the authorities of the Land in question into the case described in paragraph 89 of the report of the Special Rapporteur." 2/

Observations on paragraph 89

"Death of Angolan national Amadeu Antonio Kirova

"17. In a decision handed down on 30 May 1994, the Regional Court of Frankfurt an der Oder refused to refer the three accused police officers to a trial court, as there was no proof that they could have prevented the murder of the Angolan national.

"18. The appeal of this decision brought by the Prosecutor's Office of Frankfurt an der Oder was rejected by the Regional Superior Court of the Land of Brandenburg on 27 October 1994, which held that if the case was referred to a trial court, the accused parties would undoubtedly be acquitted."

Observations on paragraph 103

"Alleged discrimination against foreign employees

"19. The rules applicable to work contracts are the same for foreigners and for Germans. Discrimination against foreign salaried employees is prohibited, as is evident from the following regulations:

"20. In labour law, the principle of equal treatment prevails, in particular, at the stage of drawing up and executing the work contract. When a work contract is concluded, the employee is also protected by the fact that the joint works council is a co-decider in the matter of recruitment. Under article 75 of the law on the establishment of joint works councils, these bodies are required to ensure that the employees are treated in accordance with the principles of law and equity and, in particular, that they are not treated differently on the grounds of ancestry, religion, nationality, origin, political affiliation, union membership or personal opinion. If a person is discriminated against on these grounds, the joint works council may object to the recruitment of someone else. Regarding the election of the joint works council, foreigners have the same rights as all employees, that is, the right to vote and to stand for election.

"21. Regarding the termination of the employer-employee relationship, the provisions of the law on the termination of the work contract apply equally to foreign and German employees. Under article 1 of this law, race, colour and nationality may not be invoked as grounds for dismissal; nor shall these elements be considered legal criteria in taking such a decision. The same holds true for a religious or a political affiliation. In the case of dismissal, foreign employees are protected by the fact that the joint works council has a say in the decision.

"22. Under the terms of the law on employment promotion, foreign employees who have a residence and work permit in Germany are in principle legally entitled to the same benefits as their German counterparts. The same holds true as regards the creation of jobs, advanced training and refresher courses.

"23. In 1993, 22,000 foreigners received additional job training. In the western part of the country, 10 per cent of the employees holding jobs resulting from job creation measures are foreigners."

B. Observations by the Italian Government on the report submitted by the Special Rapporteur in 1995 (A/50/476)

"1. As the Special Rapporteur noted in paragraph 166 of his most recent report to the General Assembly (A/50/476), Italy has strengthened its legislation, inter alia in relation to the dissemination of racist ideas. Indeed, under Act No. 205 of 25 June 1993, incitement to discrimination itself is now considered a crime, even if it does not amount to incitement to hatred or violence. The direct effect of this new law has been a considerable decrease in the number of acts of intolerance, discrimination and racial violence. It has also enabled the judiciary and the police forces to take reprisals against certain neo-Nazi organizations.

"2. The Italian Government wishes to draw the attention of the Special Rapporteur to the concluding remarks of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination after its consideration of the eighth and ninth

periodic reports of Italy (CERD/C/237/Add.1) at its 1075th and 1076th meetings, held on 1 and 2 March 1995. Under the heading of positive developments, the Committee noted with satisfaction that Italy was one of the States parties which had made the declaration under article 14 of the Convention, and that Italy had practically abandoned its reservations to the Convention and had established a procedure for their formal withdrawal. The Committee also welcomed the introduction of certain measures to combat the resurgence of racial violence, as well as positive measures for regularization, training and health care for citizens of countries outside the European Community and stateless persons. The new measures in favour of intercultural education were also welcomed by the Committee. These included additional teaching hours for pupils with learning difficulties, most of whom, being of foreign origin, were having to deal with the language problem, as well as the Ministerial Circular on equal distribution of foreign pupils in classes in order to facilitate their social integration.

"3. Italy wishes to provide the following information concerning certain cases which were specifically mentioned in the Special Rapporteur's report:

"4. Naser Hasani (para. 58). The conclusions regarding the complaint made by Naser Hasani confirmed that a group of police officers in Florence had checked his identity papers. Hasani, who had been found to be in possession of a hammer and other tools, was released on his arrival at the police station. The police officers concerned have categorically denied having committed any act of violence. Hasani underwent a medical examination in the casualty department at the Careggi hospital (Florence). The judicial authorities, who had been promptly notified, had ordered an additional medico-legal examination because no evidence of the alleged blows had been found. The forensic physician had confirmed the total absence of any bruises or other marks which might have been connected in some way with the alleged mistreatment.

"5. Said Alaoui (para. 86). The conclusions regarding the blows he was alleged to have suffered at the hands of a group of municipal police officers in Turin have confirmed that prosecutions are currently pending against Alaoui, who has been found guilty of resisting and causing bodily harm to a public official, and Imposimato, who is charged with incitement to disobey the law. Imposimato has lodged a complaint against the police officers, accusing them of assault, threats and bodily harm. The case, which was to be heard on 12 October 1995, has been postponed until late January 1996.

"6. Moufida Ksouri (para. 111). There has been a criminal prosecution in this case. The court of San Remo, in its verdict announced on 14 July 1994, sentenced the officers who had committed the rape to five years and eight months' imprisonment, and ordered them to pay appropriate compensation to the victim."

C. Comments of the Special Rapporteur

7. The Special Rapporteur welcomes the clarifications provided by Germany and Italy regarding the alleged incidents of racial discrimination which have been brought to their attention. He congratulates both Governments for the measures they have taken to punish the offenders and to improve, through appropriate action, the situation regarding xenophobia and racial violence. The Special Rapporteur, convinced and respectful of the rule of law based on the recognition of the dignity of the human person, trusts in those two countries' systems of justice and encourages them to pursue their efforts to curb racism, racial discrimination and xenophobia. He requests the Governments concerned to keep him informed as to the outcome of the cases currently under consideration.

D. Field missions

8. In 1994 and 1995, the Special Rapporteur visited five countries (Brazil, France, Germany, the United States of America and the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) in order to illustrate the various forms of racism and racial discrimination through specific examples. It has been claimed that the presence of several Western countries among those he visited was evidence of bias on the part of the Special Rapporteur, despite his insistence on the fact that racism and racial discrimination as defined in the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination exist throughout the world. 3/ That also applies to xenophobia, one of the manifestations of racism. The Special Rapporteur's awareness of the universality of these matters is such that he will not be influenced by motives other than concern for objectivity and the wish to serve the cause of human rights. The joint consideration of the situations in Germany, France and the United Kingdom, far from stigmatizing a particular region, simply takes account of those States' desire to place their human rights policies in the context of the European Union. Also, attention was focused first on the developed States because they are experiencing a resurgence of manifestations of racism and xenophobia in those countries.

9. It should be emphasized that the goodwill of the Governments of the countries we visited made a major contribution to the successful fulfilment of the mandate. Therefore, like the Commission on Human Rights, the General Assembly should congratulate the Governments of Brazil, France, Germany, the United States of America and the United Kingdom for having established a dialogue with the Special Rapporteur and for having been attentive to his recommendations.

10. In this context, it should be added that the Government of the United States of America has transmitted to the Special Rapporteur detailed comments on the mission report which he submitted to the Commission on Human Rights at its fifty-first session (E/CN.4/1995/78/Add.1). Those comments, after translation, have now been communicated to the Special Rapporteur who will present his observations to the Commission at its fifty-third session.

11. Following consideration by the Commission on Human Rights at its fifty-second session of the report of the Special Rapporteur on his mission in Brazil (E/CN.4/1995/72/Add.1), that country's representative expressed his Government's

position in an important statement, from which the following quotations are extracts:

> "President Fernando Henrique Cardoso himself fully recognizes the persistence of racial discrimination in the country. Nevertheless, if Brazil may not be the so-called perfect example of ethnic and racial integration - if there is any - our situation is by no means characterized by racial violence or segregation.
>
> "We welcome the acknowledgement, by the Special Rapporteur, of the complexity and uniqueness of Brazil's sociological context, in which economic, social, cultural, political and historic factors play a decisive role and contribute to explain the profound interbreeding of races - Amerindian, European and African. It is also true that prejudice against people of African origin or mixed parentage, or racial discrimination through denial, to use the Rapporteur's own words, occurs mainly on a social and economic basis, because those people constitute a majority within the underprivileged and excluded segments of society.
>
> "... the reference made in paragraph 60 of the report to an alleged 'policy of ethnic genocide' is in my delegation's view entirely unjustified.
>
> "On the other hand, we cannot conceal our disagreement with the Special Rapporteur's interpretation that biological and cultural intermingling would be a cause of social stratification and of ethnoregional imbalance. Rather than an integrationist message and a basis for exclusion of any race, miscegenation is viewed in Brazil as one of the most positive aspects of the country's social life. The fact that descendants of African slaves and immigrants from Europe and Asia felt more integrated in the Brazilian 'melting pot' than in other multiracial societies might explain why physical appearance and the colour of skin - as surprising as it may appear to the Rapporteur - tend to prevail over any kind of race classification based upon legal definitions and scientific theories.
>
> "By creating uncountable gradations of skin colour, miscegenation has succeeded to curb social tensions and to avoid serious divisions and segregation in the Brazilian society. Rather than avoiding the racial issue, the Brazilian Government is doing its utmost to reduce the social inequalities so that the assertion of multiracial democracy can finally become a reality."

12. The parts of that statement regarding measures taken by the Brazilian Government to eradicate racism and racial discrimination, in particular the "National Human Rights Programme" presented by President Fernando Henrique Cardoso and published by the Brazilian Ministry of Justice, will be included in section IV, which will be devoted to measures taken by Governments.

13. During 1996, the Special Rapporteur will endeavour to continue his study of the realities of the situation in other countries. He wishes to inform the General Assembly that the Government of Colombia has agreed to a visit from

29 June to 15 July 1996; that visit was coming to an end as this report was being prepared.

14. The Special Rapporteur expresses his gratitude to the Government of Colombia for the welcome he received and the working conditions which enabled him to meet high-level officials such as ministers, heads of department, public defenders and personeros, as well as members of Congress, mayors, and representatives of indigenous and Afro-Colombian communities in various areas of the country (Bogotá, Buenaventura, Cali, Cartagena, Quibdó, and Tumaco).

15. The Special Rapporteur will present a detailed report to the Commission on Human Rights at its fifty-third session. For the moment, he has observed that since its colonization, Colombia has experienced persistent racial discrimination: the indigenous population and Black people have been marginalized, and live in deplorable economic and social conditions - they are the poorest groups. Racial discrimination seems almost natural, as can be seen from the weekly television programme Sábado feliz, in which Black people are held up to ridicule. The Constitution of 1991 and Act No. 70 of 1993 recognize and guarantee their rights and their fundamental freedoms, in particular the right to collective ownership of land and the right to preserve their cultural identity. However, equal rights are not yet reflected in everyday life; this is due to considerable socio-economic and political inertia, resistance from financially influential groups, and a climate of violence caused by friction among economic interests. There is political will to carry reforms forward, but they are thwarted by all these obstacles. Nonetheless, indigenous and Afro-Colombian communities are organizing and mobilizing, campaigning for action to fulfil the hopes which have arisen out of the basic texts. The Government says that it is mindful of these legitimate expectations.

16. The Special Rapporteur has also begun consultations with the Government of Kuwait, to prepare for a possible visit in September, the focus of which would be the situation of male and female migrant workers in that country.

17. It should also be noted that, since the reports on the missions to France, Germany and the United Kingdom were not available in all the working languages, the Commission on Human Rights deferred its consideration of them until its next session.

III. CONTEMPORARY FORMS AND MANIFESTATIONS OF RACISM, RACIAL DISCRIMINATION AND XENOPHOBIA

18. The Special Rapporteur wishes to highlight the most critical situations to which the General Assembly could give its attention. He observes that the forms and manifestations of racism and racial discrimination are of a recurrent nature, and they are given particular intensity by the worldwide immigration crisis, renewed denials of the existence of the Nazi holocaust, and profanations and arson in places of worship and cemeteries.

A. The worldwide immigration crisis

19. The international community has endeavoured to organize the worldwide movements of goods, services, currencies and information without taking account of the simultaneous movements of people. As a result, it is now faced with problems in regulating migratory flows from the poorest regions to the most prosperous, as well as with the settlement of immigrant populations. The problem is a worldwide one: in Africa, America, Asia, Europe or the Pacific, men and women who, looking for a better life, have set out in search of a place in the global village are impeded by discriminatory barriers. Their fundamental rights, such as the right to freedom of movement, the right to leave any country, the right to marry and to choose a spouse are increasingly subject to regulations which refer directly or indirectly to their racial identity and national or ethnic origin, or to preference for nationals. All over the world, immigrants have become easy scapegoats and sacrificial victims of the economic crisis. Described as illegal immigrants or seen as responsible for all the problems of the societies in which they live (crime, unemployment, social security deficits), such people have an increasingly precarious existence whether they have entered a country legally or illegally.

20. In Asia, intraregional migration creates tension between countries of emigration (Bangladesh, India, Indonesia, Myanmar, Pakistan, the Philippines, Sri Lanka) and host countries (Japan, Malaysia, Republic of Korea, Singapore, Taiwan, Thailand), because of the way in which the citizens of the former are treated. 4/ A great proportion of immigrants from those countries consists of women, who are particularly subject to double discrimination, that is, both as women and as migrants. A study by the International Labour Office, based upon a number of reliable sources, contained the following observations:

> "Asian female labour migration is strongly characterized by the concentration in a very limited number of female-dominated occupations: as domestic workers, entertainers (often a euphemism for prostitutes), helpers in restaurants and hotels, assembly line workers in labour-intensive manufacturing (...).
>
> "Study after study has highlighted the plight of female migrants in these occupations, especially domestic service and prostitution. The domestic helper embarks on an overseas stint holding on to a domestic helper contract which is more often than not violated or substituted with discriminatory and unfair employment conditions, specifically depressed wages. Domestic workers are usually paid sub-standard salaries which are sometimes delayed or withheld, days off are not observed, food is inadequate, accommodations are unsafe and uncomfortable, medical benefits are denied, mobility is limited. Numerous cases of maltreatment, sexual harassment and abuses, excessive workload, working for an extra household, are likewise noted. The high incidence of non-completion of contracts and premature returns, especially among women migrating to the Middle East, has been interpreted as indicative of the stressful nature of their situation. A Middle East Watch report estimated that for the 12 months beginning in May 1991, 1,400 Filipino domestic servants and hundreds of Indian, Bangladeshi and Sri Lankan maids sought refuge in their home embassies.

Others were picked up by the police after running away and either arrested or returned to their employers." 5/

21. Mass expulsions of migrant workers give rise to some concern regarding human rights, as has the severity of justice in certain countries when persons with immigrant status have been accused, rightly or wrongly, of criminal offences. One such case was the deterioration in relations between the Philippines and Malaysia in 1994, when the Malaysian authorities arrested and deported several hundred Philippine domestic workers for staying and working in the country illegally. Similarly, relations between the Philippines and Singapore deteriorated in 1995 after the execution of Flor Contemplación, a domestic worker who had been accused of murdering her employer; the Philippine authorities had cast doubt on the circumstances of the trial.

22. The Malaysian authorities accuse immigrants of criminal activities and of spreading disease. In Japan, extreme right-wing groups have written xenophobic slogans on signs in public gardens frequented by foreigners. Certain countries claim that the arrival of immigrants is a threat to national security. For example, the Thai authorities consider that the presence of 350,000 "illegal" immigrants from Myanmar is a threat to the country's security. Measures of increasing severity are taken to control migratory flows and expel "illegal immigrants". The Republic of Korea has declared that it will expel all "illegal immigrants" in 1999. 6/

23. The same stringent attitude to immigration is seen in Europe, where most member States of the European Union have adopted tougher legislation. As an example of this major trend, France has a particularly strict policy. The French National Assembly's commission of inquiry on illegal immigration and unlawful residence in France by foreigners recently proposed a series of measures to improve control over immigration by non-Europeans. Many observers consider that these measures contravene human rights. Inter alia, the commission recommended that:

> "(a) The issuing of short-stay visas should be more systematically subject to proof of health insurance or, failing that, a medical examination by a physician approved by the consulate. This formality would be required in countries where the 'migratory risk' ('risque migratoire') is high and which have concluded no social security treaty with France; [Underlining by the Special Rapporteur.]
>
> "(b) Improvements should be made in the identification of visa applicants in countries where there is a migratory risk: consideration should be given to setting up a file containing the applicants' fingerprints. Such fingerprinting would be carried out in those countries where there is a migratory risk and which do not take their citizens' fingerprints before issuing national identity papers;
>
> "(c) The procedure for the issuing of the 'certificat d'hébergement' should be reformed, by means of:
>
> . creation of lists of persons offering accommodation;

. verification of those persons' financial means;

. increasing mayors' powers of assessment and verification;

. on-site inspections;

. legal responsibility of the person offering accommodation." 7/

24. It has also been recommended that hospital care for illegal aliens should be restricted to "emergencies" or to diseases which are "likely to be contagious". In addition, the maximum period of administrative detention for persons who have entered France illegally and who are subject to expulsion is to be increased to 40 days.

25. These proposals are intended to increase the severity of the "Pasqua Acts", which are already difficult to enforce and have placed many immigrants in a precarious situation. In an advisory opinion published on 3 June 1996, the Commission nationale consultative Française des droits de l'homme (French National Advisory Human Rights Commission) warned the Government that if the proposals become law, they are likely to "increase people's mistrust of foreigners, give greater credibility to those who favour a demagogic policy of exclusion and xenophobia, and make it more difficult to implement integration policies". In addition, the concept of "countries where there is a migratory risk" is ambiguous and has discriminatory implications. The Commission considers such provisions "inappropriate and dangerous". For the time being, the Government has had to reconsider the preparation of a draft Bill containing the proposals. In the meantime, the country has suddenly become aware of the issue of the "sans papiers", or African immigrants, many of whom are the parents of children who hold French nationality. The administrative situation of some of them is being regularized, thanks to pressure from a group of human rights mediators and from public opinion, but charter flights are continuing to repatriate many of those concerned to Mali and Senegal.

26. In addition to the situation in mainland France, an inquiry carried out by seven French associations in Saint Martin (in the Caribbean) and French Guiana has exposed numerous cases in the overseas départements in which the law on the entry and residence of foreigners is enforced improperly. "Checking of identity papers on grounds of personal appearance, summary deportations, illegal destruction of dwellings, etc." are widespread practices. 8/

27. Beyond the current debate on immigration control in France, the Commission nationale consultative Française des droits de l'homme, in its 1995 report, noted that "the combined growth of intolerance and exclusion continues to menace the health of our society, which has been weakened physically by the economic crisis and morally by the crisis in its values". The Commission identifies three phenomena which are typical of the climate in France in 1995:

"(1) There has been a resurgence of acts of extreme racist or xenophobic violence, including seven murders;

"(2) Persons of North African origin are the principal victims of such acts. Six of the seven people killed were of Tunisian, Algerian or

Moroccan origin. Compared to the total number of acts of racist violence, those against North Africans have reached the unprecedented level of 70 per cent;

"(3) The tendency to see xenophobic opinions as a part of everyday life is spreading to more and more levels of society." 9/

28. There are also immigration-related problems in Switzerland, where the Commission fédérale contre le racisme has recently submitted to the Federal Council a report on the Swiss policy on migration. The report analyses the "three circles model" adopted by the Federal Council in 1991 to regulate the recruitment of foreign labour. 10/ Within the inner, or first circle, which includes citizens of the European Union and the European Free Trade Association, the movement of labour is completely free; and in the middle (second) circle, which currently comprises the United States of America, Canada, Australia and New Zealand, and to which the States of Central and Eastern Europe may later be added, a limited number of people may be recruited. Theoretically, there can be no recruitment in the outer (third) circle, comprising "the rest of the world", except for special cases involving highly qualified specialists.

29. The distinctions are based on criteria of geography, culture, national politics and economics. The Commission has expressed reservations concerning the arguments which have been used to make the distinction between the second and third circles, particularly the "culture gap" argument. Referring to the positions taken on various occasions by the Federal Council, the Commission has noted that "persons from the third circle are considered incapable of becoming integrated, and therefore undesirable, because they do not belong to the same culture broadly characterized by European ideas". The Commission considers that "the three circles model is basically racist. The arbitrary division of the world into concentric circles centred upon Switzerland is ethnocentric and Eurocentric. The categories introduced in the three circles model define people by their origin. The model creates new social realities which have negative and discriminatory effects upon part of the population living in Switzerland. This contravenes the purposes of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, offends against human dignity and, all in all, is a threat to civil peace in our country." 10/

30. The Commission further considers that "the division of the world into close and distant groups, those who can or cannot become integrated, which has been established by the authorities and is constantly cited by the general public, and the resulting construction of an image of the alien, the 'Other'", has symbolic effects which are harmful. The Commission recalls that "all recent scientific studies concerning the issue of ethnic and cultural otherness emphasize the influence of dominant discourse, such as that of State institutions, on the formation of groups, the hardening of boundaries and the escalation of conflicts." 10/

31. The situation of migrants in the United States of America also merits consideration by the General Assembly. The problems occur when migrants cross the frontier between the United States of America and Mexico. There has been "a mobilization against foreigners unprecedented since the second world war", 11/ particularly in California. The situation is due to the "illegal" entry of

about 300,000 people per year into the territory of the United States of America, despite the use of electronic barriers and the strengthening of border patrols. The majority of those people are Mexican citizens. Mexico is also a stepping-stone for Chinese, Indian, Cubans and Russians, as well as for Central American migrants transported by traffickers in migrant workers.

32. Two particularly violent incidents have been condemned by the Mexican authorities:

(a) On 1 April 1996, in Riverside County, California, two illegal immigrants were severely beaten when police officers caught them after a chase;

(b) On 6 April 1996, also in Riverside County, seven Mexicans who had entered the United States of America illegally died in a road accident while attempting to escape from a border patrol. The Mexican authorities have called for a review of immigration control methods and legislation in the United States of America. However, the Mexican National Commission for Human Rights considers that migrants transiting through Mexico are also mistreated by Mexican immigration officers. In a study carried out in July 1996, the Commission notes that 67 per cent of illegal aliens were subjected to mistreatment, blows or threats.

33. It is therefore a complex situation, requiring mediation by the General Assembly.

34. In Israel, the integration of the Falashas (Ethiopian Jews) who arrived in the mid-1980s is not without problems. On 28 January 1996, 10,000 Ethiopian immigrants held a violent demonstration in Tel Aviv against the "racism and racial discrimination" to which they claim to have been subjected, and which were reflected, inter alia, by the rejection for several years of blood given by members of the Falasha community for transfusions, as revealed by the Ma'ariv newspaper in its edition of 24 January 1996. The policy has been defended by the Chairman of the National Committee on AIDS, on the grounds that the rate of HIV infection among Ethiopians is believed to be higher than among the general population; that assertion has not, however, been proved scientifically. The blood donor incident is said to be only one symptom of the difficulties experienced by the Falashas in becoming integrated into Israeli society. It is alleged that they have been subjected to "racism and humiliation" in the Israeli army and that some have been driven to suicide as a result. 12/ In the field of education, Ethiopian children and those of other Mizrahim 13/ are allegedly placed in specialized streams in secondary school, guiding them towards training in manual jobs and away from higher education. 14/ There is also allegedly some discrimination against the Falashas in the area of housing. The Special Rapporteur has passed on these allegations to the Israeli authorities and invited them to comment. 15/ The Israeli Government considers that the allegations of racial discrimination against the Ethiopian Jews in Israel are completely unfounded and are merely an attempt by those who have made them to exploit genuine and urgent social problems for political purposes. 16/ The Israeli Government also informed the Special Rapporteur of the creation of a Commission of Inquiry on blood donations by Ethiopians, chaired by a former President of the State of Israel, Mr. Yitzhak Navon, and made up of eminent Israelis and representatives of the Ethiopian community. The Special

Rapporteur, not having received the Commission's conclusions, is not yet able to report on them.

35. Concerning the overall problem of the integration of the Ethiopian Jews, who number 56,000, the Government has presented a report to the Special Rapporteur, detailing the efforts towards the "assimilation of the Ethiopian immigrants in Israel: the current situation and the objectives to be achieved". [Underlining by the Special Rapporteur.] The length of the document is such that it cannot be reproduced here in full. However, it states that "the immigration of the Ethiopian Jews has led to major problems, particularly that of their integration", and that the State of Israel is "working resolutely for their full integration into Israeli society:

> "Measures have been taken in areas such as housing, employment and education. A system of 99 per cent mortgages for amounts up to $120,000 has been set up for the Ethiopian Jews to enable them to purchase homes in conurbations located in the central areas, thereby preventing them from becoming concentrated in peripheral communities which offer insufficient opportunities for full integration. To provide improved employment opportunities, a series of training programmes has been created, oriented especially towards helping them acquire the basic skills required in order to adapt to the needs of an industrialized society. In the field of education, account has been taken of the fact that access to education in Ethiopia was limited; initially, children are placed in separate classes in order to acquire the linguistic skills and other knowledge that they must have in order to become integrated into mainstream classes. According to a study carried out in 1993 by the JDC-Brookdale Institute, 70 per cent of the children had joined these classes within about one year. For the 1995-1996 school year, 95 per cent had joined mainstream classes. To help schools to cope with this challenge, various special assistance measures have been taken, including the following:
>
> - "Teachers spend extra time with the children (1.7 teaching hours per week and per child; in the case of children who arrived after 1 January 1991, there is no limit on this extra time);
>
> - "Supplementary programmes are organized outside school hours.
>
> "Adolescents were admitted to the Aliya boarding schools (for social and economic integration of immigrants) sponsored by the Jewish Agency, while their families lived in temporary housing. As they become settled in permanent housing, the young people are encouraged to remain in the community where they live. The JDC-Brookdale Institute survey shows that in 1995 a high percentage of 14-year-old adolescents attended school in their communities.
>
> "Through all of these programmes, it has been possible to reduce the school drop-out rate significantly and to provide 12 years of schooling for most young Ethiopians. Nonetheless, their performance lags markedly behind that of other Israeli children, at both the elementary and the secondary levels. There seem to be problems of absenteeism in certain communities, but no specific information is available on this subject as yet. It should

be noted that the school drop-out rate is generally higher in the rest of the Israeli population, particularly among low-income groups."

36. In South Africa, some 10 million immigrants have settled illegally. Half of them are from Mozambique. As elsewhere, the foreigners are accused of everything that goes wrong, particularly the high rate of crime in certain outlying districts of Johannesburg. The Government intends to normalize the situation of illegal immigrants who entered the country more than five years ago and send the others back to their countries of origin. In 1995, it reportedly spent more than $30 million to repatriate 100,000 clandestine immigrants. 17/

37. Having become aware of a tract threatening foreigners, namely, nationals of neighbouring African countries, who had come to seek their fortune in Côte d'Ivoire, the Special Rapporteur wrote to the Government of Côte d'Ivoire to inquire about rumours of a wave of xenophobia sweeping through the country, in order to prevent any incidents which might lead to pogroms between ethnic groups and foreigners as in the past. 18/ The Government of Côte d'Ivoire has not responded.

B. Racist horror and terror become commonplace

38. This section deals with the resurgence of denial of the holocaust in France, and the increase in the number of cases of arson of African-American churches in the south of the United States of America.

39. The school of thought which denies the holocaust, that is, essentially negates the historicity of the gas chambers and the genocide of the Jews, has recently resurfaced in France following the publication of Mr. Roger Garaudy's work entitled "Les mythes fondateurs de la politique israélienne". The author claims that "the myth of the 6 million Jews who were exterminated has become dogma which regards as sacred (as the word 'holocaust' itself would indicate) all of Israel's abuses in Palestine". Garaudy maintains that the Jews make use of the Shoah in order to place themselves "above all international law". He believes that "no critical rebuttal no scientific debate" has ever disproved the claims of those who deny the holocaust; they have been met with only silence or suppression. Accordingly, he believes that "there might be doubt and even scepticism" about the reality of the Shoah.

40. These views triggered a huge debate when the famous champion of the poor, human rights militant and founder of Emmaüs, the Abbé Pierre, defended Mr. Garaudy despite the fact that the author had been investigated for the denial of crimes against humanity. The court investigation into the case is proceeding and the Abbé Pierre, having refused to condemn Mr. Garaudy's ideas, has been expelled from the International League against Racism and Anti-Semitism. The Abbé has also incurred the criticism of the media for denouncing a "Zionist plot". 19/

41. This incident, one of many in the 1990s, seeks to make the Jewish genocide a commonplace in order to ensure that anti-Semitism - a painful issue and one of the most sensitive - becomes firmly entrenched.

42. In the south of the United States of America, an unprecedented wave of arson of churches and parishes belonging to the African-American community is sowing fear of a resurgence of anti-Black racism in the country. In all, 34 churches have been destroyed, particularly in Mississippi, Alabama, Tennessee, Kentucky, Georgia, South Carolina and the northern part of Oklahoma. Although two suspects belonging to the racist organization known as the Ku Klux Klan have been arrested, the arrest of a third suspect, an adolescent who allegedly set fire to a Black church in South Carolina, precludes the investigators from embracing the theory that these fires are part of a nationwide racist plot, as the leaders of the Black community claim.

43. Nevertheless, it may be noted that these incidents are taking place in a general climate of growing tension between American racial communities. 20/ Such tensions were expressed, in particular, at the time of the spectacular acquittal of the football player O. J. Simpson, accused of having killed his ex-wife, and the "Million Man March" organized on 16 October 1995 by the controversial Black leader Louis Farrakhan. Moreover, according to the Black minister Jesse Jackson, increased initiatives to eliminate affirmative action programmes established to facilitate access to education and employment by ethnic minorities, an extension of the civil rights movement of the 1960s, help to aggravate the tension. The Special Rapporteur had also recommended to the Government of the United States that it should once again update its affirmative action programmes with a view to remedying the negative impact of the health, housing, education and employment policies of the 1980s. 21/ Lastly, it should be noted that the United States Supreme Court recently handed down a decision which prohibits the division of voting districts along racial lines, at the risk of impeding the political representation of ethnic minorities.

44. Aware of the danger inherent in this wave of arson, President Clinton hastened to respond to the turmoil in the African-American community by announcing in his radio broadcast of 8 June 1996 his determination to find the authors of these crimes and expose their motives. A special investigation unit comprising a number of police squads was set up to hunt down the guilty parties. More than 200 federal agents from the Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco and Firearms and the Federal Bureau of Investigation are at work on the case. President Clinton also went to Greeleyville, a small, mostly Black town with a population of 500 inhabitants in South Carolina, in order to attend the inauguration of the new church built after the former one was destroyed by fire.

C. Incitement to racial hatred through electronic and computer networks

45. The consequences of the development of information and communication technology are not all positive. A growing trend has been observed among racist organizations to use electronic mail or the Internet to spread racist or xenophobic propaganda. 22/ So-called discussion forums or sites from Europe and America for the dissemination of racist and xenophobic messages are multiplying on the Internet. Thus, a German extremist called Ernest Zuendel living in Toronto, Canada, publishes anti-Semitic literature under such explicit titles as "Auschwitz: myth and reality", "The holocaust: let's hear both sides" or "Were there really 6 million deaths?". 23/ A Californian server, the Committee

for Open Debate on the Holocaust, offers "revisionist research and opinions from the entire world". 24/ The Simon Wiesenthal Center in Los Angeles has identified 70 such sites on the Internet.

46. The control of information transmitted over the Internet poses a problem. No national legislation has any power over this worldwide network. Should international measures be taken, for example, the immediate launching of studies, research or dialogue? In France, efforts to control the situation are being made by the Minister of Telecommunications who decided to extend the powers of the High-level Committee on Telematics.

IV. MEASURES TAKEN BY GOVERNMENTS AND JUDICIAL BODIES

A. Implementation of the recommendations formulated by the Special Rapporteur

47. The effectiveness of the struggle against racism and racial discrimination depends on how the Special Rapporteur's general or specific recommendations to Governments are followed up. Thus, the Special Rapporteur wishes, in particular, to note with satisfaction the measures already taken by the Brazilian Government, as illustrated by the following excerpts from the statement delivered by its representative to the fifty-second session of the Commission on Human Rights:

> "We wish to thank Mr. Glèlè-Ahanhanzo for the interesting and thought-provoking report on his mission to Brazil of June 1995. The Brazilian Government is carefully evaluating the conclusions and recommendations submitted by the Special Rapporteur which will certainly be useful in the consideration of further measures aimed at improving the status of the Black and indigenous communities, as well as of people of mixed parentage.
>
> "Some of the suggestions put forward by the Special Rapporteur are already being taken care of in the context of ongoing governmental initiatives aimed at reducing social inequalities and ensuring the implementation of the anti-discrimination provisions contained in the 1988 Federal Constitution and other relevant legal instruments.
>
> "In November 1995, President Fernando Henrique Cardoso enacted a Decree establishing an interministerial working group with a view to considering and proposing public policies for the enhancement of the Black population. The working group is composed of representatives of governmental agencies, universities and Black movements. It started its deliberations last January and is currently discussing a list of 15 issues, including possible affirmative action policies and special measures in areas such as education, health, labour, foreign affairs, culture and religion, racism and violence, and the restitution of lands to the descendants of former slaves who lived in the quilombo communities.
>
> "The interministerial working group will also devote its attention to the image of people of African descent in the media and in advertising, as well as to the inclusion of colour/race criteria in official data and

personal documentation. Besides that, the federal Government is establishing a tripartite working group on the elimination of discrimination in employment, with a view to enforcing, in partnership with the International Labour Organization, observance of ILO Convention 111 in relation to persons of African descent, women and underprivileged people. Both mechanisms are, of course, intended to be complementary."

48. In addition to measures that are specifically designed to combat racism and racial discrimination, the Special Rapporteur also hopes that the national human rights programme recently elaborated on the initiative of President Cardoso will contribute to the full enjoyment of human rights. In this context, the investigation into the problem of the sterilization of Black women, which he proposed in his mission report, should be carried out.

B. Judicial measures

49. In Rio de Janeiro, the sentencing of one of the police officers implicated in the Candelaria massacre of 1993 (massacre of seven street children in front of the Church of Candelaria) to 20 years in prison also demonstrates the Brazilian authorities' will to tackle head on the violations of the rights of the child by the police forces or by death squads.

50. Also worthy of mention in this section is the appointment in Sydney, Australia, of the first aborigine judge. The appointment of Mr. Bob Bellear is the result of the reconciliation policy followed by the Australian authorities for a number of years.

51. In Germany, the American Neo-Nazi Gary Lauck, accused of the large-scale dissemination of racist propaganda in Germany and of inciting racial hatred in violation of the penal code, was brought before a criminal court in Hamburg in September 1995 following his extradition from Denmark.

V. INITIATIVES BY CIVIL SOCIETY

52. Commitment on the part of non-governmental organizations, unions and community associations is essential in order to thwart manifestations of racism and racial discrimination. This has been particularly apparent in France, where community organizations unanimously condemned the report of the Parliamentary Commission of Inquiry on illegal immigration. Five judiciary organizations, including the Association of Judges and Prosecutors and the trade union known as the Confédération Française Démocratique du Travail (CFDT) - legal section, the Union of French Lawyers (SAF), the International League against Racism and anti-Semitism, the Movement against Racism and for Friendship among Peoples, Médecins sans Frontières (Doctors without Borders) and the French Association of Democratic Jurists denounced the risks to the enjoyment of human rights inherent in the proposals of the Parliamentary Commission of Inquiry, thus compelling the Government to defer the elaboration of a draft act incorporating these proposals. 25/ On Saturday, 15 June 1996, a demonstration of 10,000 people, called by a number of anti-racist associations, was held in Paris to condemn discrimination against immigrants and, in particular, the negative impact of the

Pasqua laws which make their situation increasingly uncertain. Mention should also be made of the energetic action taken by the Collectif des Médiateurs (mediators' association), under the chairmanship of His Excellency Ambassador Eyssel, on behalf of immigrants who have no papers and the tremendous show of solidarity by the Christian churches and the forces of progress in the early summer of 1996 in defence of the right to live as a family.

53. In Switzerland, the French-speaking Association against Racism has set up a toll-free telephone line, 155 SOS Racisme, to assist all those who feel that they have encountered problems of racism and racial discrimination, whether as victims or as witnesses. It has also developed community mediation techniques for resolving conflicts arising from xenophobic or racist behaviour within the community. Mediation is used in particular to resolve conflicts between neighbours and at the workplace.

54. In Burundi, two European humanitarian organizations have launched radio programmes to counterbalance radio stations that spread ethnic hatred.

VI. CONCLUSIONS

55. At the international level, the question of racism and racial discrimination remains alarming. It has crystallized in the current immigration crisis. Increasingly restrictive and discriminatory regulations are undermining freedom of movement and residence and the right to live as a family.

56. Racist ideologies are being spread by the most modern information techniques, and racist violence is manifesting itself in the burning of places of worship and the profanation of cemeteries belonging to ethnic minorities.

57. The international community cannot remain indifferent to such acts. The Special Rapporteur therefore recommends to the General Assembly that it should convene without further delay a world conference on racism, racial discrimination and xenophobia and include the question of immigration and xenophobia in the agenda, or explore the possibility of holding another conference on this specific theme.

58. Moreover, in addition to the human rights education measures with a view to promoting tolerance and peace already recommended in his most recent report to the General Assembly, the Special Rapporteur wishes to suggest to the Assembly that it should explore the possibility of establishing a fund to assist ethnic or racial communities that are victims of racial discrimination and condemned to live in conditions of injustice and inequality which are unacceptable as the millennium draws to an end. Can we not envisage an appropriate affirmative action mechanism at the international level? The people whom the Special Rapporteur met during his field missions are pinning their hopes on the United Nations; they wish to see the human rights proclaimed and reaffirmed in the International Bill of Human Rights translated into reality and made effective for them.

59. Lastly, reports should be more widely disseminated by the most modern means, in particular the Internet, and recommendations should be followed up.

Notes

1/ E/CN.4/1996/72 and Add.1.

2/ The documents referred to are available in the Secretariat for consultation.

3/ See E/CN.4/1994/66, para. 18; A/49/677, para.47; E/CN.4/1996/72, para. 67; E/CN.4/1996/72/Add.1, para. 1.

4/ See International Labour Office, International Labour Migration of Asian Women: distinctive characteristics and policy concerns, Geneva, February 1996; "East Asia's immigration crisis demands careful choices", International Herald Tribune, 22 May 1996, p. 5; "Migrant workers: problem and boom - Thailand and Malaysia magnets for millions of poorer Asians", International Herald Tribune, 8 June 1996, p. 4.

5/ International Labour Office, International Labour Migration of Asian Women ...

6/ International Herald Tribune, 22 May 1996, p. 5.

7/ National Assembly; Immigration clandestine et séjour irrégulier d'étrangers en France (Illegal immigration and residence in France by foreigners), vol. I, Paris 1996.

8/ See En Guyane et à Saint Martin. Des étrangers sans droits dans une France bananière (In Guyana and Saint Martin. Foreigners without rights in France's banana republic), a report on a mission from 2 to 12 December 1995. The associations which took part in the mission were: Asosyasion Solidarité Karaib (ASSOKA) (Caribbean Solidarity Association), Comité catholique contre la faim et pour le développement (CCFD) (Catholic Committee against hunger and for development), Groupe d'information et de soutien des travailleurs immigrés (GISTI) (Information and Support Group for Migrant Workers), Magistrats européens pour la démocratie et les libertés (MEDEL) (European magistrates for democracy and civil rights), Service oecuménique d'entraide (CIMADE) (Ecumenical Mutual Aid Service), Syndicat des avocats de France (SAF) (French Lawyers' Union), Syndicat de la Magistrature (SM) (Magistrates' Union).

9/ See Commission nationale consultative des droits de l'homme; 1995 - La lutte contre le racisme et la xénophobie (The Struggle against Racism and Xenophobia), Paris, La Documentation française 1996, pp. 12-13.

10/ See Prise de position de la Commission fédérale contre le racisme concernant le modèle des trois cercles du Conseil fédéral sur la politique suisse à l'égard des étrangers, Berne, May 1996.

11/ Le Monde diplomatique, June 1996, p. 20.

12/ Cf. "Ethiopian immigrants confront the State" in News from within, vol. XII, No. 2, February 1996, p. 18.

13/ Mizrahim is the Hebrew term for non-European Jews.

14/ "Ethiopian immigrants confront the State", p. 19; "Israel shuns Ethiopians, even their Jewish blood", International Herald Tribune, 26 January 1996, p. 1.

15/ Letter dated 2 February 1996 addressed to the Permanent Representative of Israel to the United Nations Office at Geneva.

16/ Letter dated 26 February 1996 from the Permanent Representative of Israel to the United Nations Office at Geneva.

17/ Jeune Afrique, No. 1846 (22-28 May 1996), p. 4.

18/ Letter dated 2 February 1996 from the Special Rapporteur to the Permanent Representative of Côte d'Ivoire to the United Nations Office at Geneva.

19/ The article by Philippe Viddier in Le Monde diplomatique of June 1996, p. 3, "Nouvelle affaire négationiste. Zones d'ombre et coup monté", is of interest in this respect.

20/ See in this connection the report of the Special Rapporteur on his mission to the United States of America from 9 to 22 October 1994 (E/CN.4/1995/78/Add.1).

21/ Ibid., para. 112.

22/ "Extremists are active in global network of hate", International Herald Tribune, 12 May 1995, pp. 1 and 6; "Le débat sur le contrôle d'Internet est relancé", Le Monde, 28-29 January 1996, p. 17; "Internet: venin en direct", France-Soir, 6 June 1996, p. 4.

23/ Le Monde, 28-29 January 1996.

24/ Le Monde diplomatique, June 1996, p. 3.

25/ Le Monde, Thursday, 18 April 1996, p. 3; see also "French Rights Group Protest", International Herald Tribune, 6 June 1996, p. 5.